

HERITAGE CITATION REPORT

Name	Former St. James Presbyterian Church	
Address	10 Creswick Street MINERS REST	Significance Level Local
Place Type	Church	
Citation Date	2012	



Former St. James Presbyterian Church, Miners Rest

HERITAGE CITATION REPORT

Recommended **VHR No HI No PS Yes**
Heritage Protection

History and Historical Context

Historical Overview

Refer to attachment for an illustrated and referenced version of this history.

2.1 The Original Inhabitants

The area of Miners Rest was formerly the country of the Burrumbeet Bulag Koori community. Burrumbeet Creek and other water bodies were important in the community as a source of food, water and shelter. There is little evidence today of occupation by the original inhabitants, with two artifact scatters near the Gillies Road/Olliers Road intersection being the main known archaeological evidence.

2.2 Brief History of Miners Rest

In the early 1850s, Miners Rest occupied a strategic location, being midway between the then recently discovered goldfields of Clunes and Buninyong, and on the Burrumbeet Creek, a source of permanent and flowing water. The small township was therefore established before Ballarat. Surveyed and proclaimed in 1856, the name of town also signified its role as a resting place, with many hotels and other accommodation houses providing respite on the route from one goldfield to another.

In the early years, Miners Rest boasted six licensed premises, including the Newmarket Hotel (the original miners' rest) on the corner of Howe Street and Cummins Road. Various Christian denominations were well represented from the 1850s, including the Anglican, Wesleyan, Catholic and Presbyterian Churches. By the close of the 20th century, only the former Presbyterian Church survived, with all other Churches having closed and the buildings removed.

The first school at Miners Rest was operated by the Wesleyans between 1859 and 1876, after which time the centre for education was the Miners Rest State School.

There was also a post office, police station and residence, brickworks and flour mill, Cobb and Co. stables, various shops, accommodation establishments and slaughter yards.

Early civil works included the Soldiers' Drain and Caledonian bridge that remain along Miners Rest Road. Wells for watering horses were also dug at various points around the township. A public park was reserved in the centre of town on the Burrumbeet Creek in 1873.

Of particular interest in the town is the house at the corner of Creswick and Dundas Streets, which belonged to James Scobie, a well-known horse trainer in the latter 19th and early 20th centuries. Scobie had considerable success, including training the winners of the 1900 Melbourne Cup and Victoria Derby and the 1903 South Australia Derby, Victoria Derby and Caulfield Cup.

Creswick Street was the original main road through Miners Rest, although the early avenue of larger Monterey Pine trees that signified this role have recently been removed.

The discovery of gold in Ballarat in 1853 rapidly eroded the function of Miners Rest as an important resting place to and

HERITAGE CITATION REPORT

from Clunes, with the function of the town changing to a service centre for the surrounding agricultural district and horse racing industry. The establishment of the Dowling Forest Racecourse in 1867 assisted to revive some of the early fortunes of the settlement.

2.3 History of St. James' Presbyterian Church

Early Establishment of the Presbyterian Church at Miners Rest

On 14 December 1858, the Rev. George Mackie, Presbyterian Minister, called a public meeting for the following day at Mr Tait's Derby Hotel, Miners Rest, for the purpose of taking steps to erect a Presbyterian Church in the town. As the meeting was 'thinly attended' owing to harvest operations, the Rev. Mackie and two farmers in the neighborhood visited 'nearly all the Presbyterian families adjacent' and it was resolved that a Presbyterian Church at Miners Rest would be a great advantage to the area.

Mackie subsequently made an application to the Honorable C.G. Duffy, Minister for Lands and Water, for a grant of land for the purpose of establishing a Presbyterian Church. Although the Rev. Mackie sort four allotments in Creswick Street (the main road to Clunes), it was allotments 14 and 15 in Section B in the Township of Miners Rest that were ultimately reserved on 26 April 1859. The first Trustees were James Ross, Benjamin Kerr, William Simpson, Donald Kennedy and William Tait.

Building of the Church

The architect from Ballarat, J.A. Doane, was appointed to design the church building in 1859. The small rendered brick Gothic church opened in September 1859, with the Rev. Mackie preaching in the forenoon and the Rev. Walker in the afternoon. The *Ballarat Star* reported on the opening and described the building as follows:

The church was well filled on both occasions. The building of this place reflects great credit upon the Presbyterians of the district. It is a really handsome church, and is fitted up to accommodate 200. It is built of brick, upon a foundation of blue stone. The architect is Mr Doane, and the contractor, Mr Francis.

Alterations, Additions & Other Improvements

Doane's original design of the Presbyterian Church at Miners Rest was a simple steeply-pitched, gabled hall, having a large central entrance door at the front. In 1865-66, a small gabled porch was added over the front entrance and this porch survives today. It appears that the building was originally built in face brick as in 1869 a Church working committee agreed to plaster the outside 'with cement'. Other agreed repairs at this time included making the roof watertight, plastering in the internal walls and sheeting the ceiling with timber. A subsequent working committee meeting of 1869 discussed the option of lath and plastering the ceiling, but it appears that timber lining boards were added as previously proposed.

In 1889, the original pulpit was removed, probably to allow access to the newly-built vestry at the rear of the Church (the Church Minutes for September 1889 described the furnishing of the vestry for the first time). The vestry was re-clad in the existing polycarbonate wall cladding in 1986-87 and it was also at this time when the external vestry door was replaced due to vandalism.

Numerous other alterations and additions occurred to the church and grounds throughout the 19th and 20th centuries. In 1901-02, the church building was re-roofed (this may have included the replacement of an original slate roof with galvanized corrugated steel sheets) and windows were repaired.

HERITAGE CITATION REPORT

Notable change occurred in 1952, resulting from funds made available from the bequest of £1000 of the late W. Gilmour. The church building was repainted inside and outside, including painting the 'silky oak dado around the inside', electricity was installed and a new concrete post and cyclone wire fence erected across the front boundary, complete with two new gates. It might have also been at this time when the early leadlighting in the side windows and porch window were replaced with the existing frosted yellow glazing.

The earliest-known surviving photographs of the church building are dated 1959, at the time of the centenary celebrations. They show the recently-painted walls, corrugated sheet metal roof, the front porch that had been added in 1865-66 and the front fence that had been erected in 1952.

It was also in 1952 when a new fire brigade building was constructed next to the church grounds. The Church Committee 'agreed to favor the building to be erected as far as possible to the south and east sides of the block so as not to block the approach of the church.' Throughout the 1950s, the fire brigade building was used by the Presbyterian Church for social functions, including an afternoon tea associated with a Women's Rally to mark the centenary of the Miners Rest Church in 1959.

In 1962, the local Presbyterian Church Board of Management purchased an air force building and had it relocated to the church grounds to serve as a hall. The relocation occurred on 25 January 1962. It was first used for a kitchen tea for Wendy Draffin.

During the 1960s and 1970s, the pulpit was altered, carpet laid along the central aisle of the church and on the dais, linoleum laid on the vestry floor and blinds installed in the vestry. In 1973, a toilet block was constructed at the rear of the church. All of these works were funded by the Ladies Guild, as was the purchase of a new electric organ that replaced the organ acquired in 1900 (the first organ having been installed in 1876). Overall, the exterior of the Church does not appear to have been noticeably altered in the later 20th century, as shown in the following historical photographs by John Collins of the National Trust between 1977 and 1985:

In 1986, resulting from a bequest of the estate of Eileen Wilkins, the exterior and interior of the church building was again painted. Little additional repairs appear to have been carried out during the ensuing years.

Church Administration & Other Developments

From 1859, Presbyterian Church services were not only held at Miners Rest, but at the nearby settlements of Coghills Creek and Mt Blowhard. As a church was not erected at Mt Blowhard, the other Churches went forward under the Presbyterian administration of the Joint Charge of Miners Rest-Coghills Creek. With the closure of the gold mines in surrounding districts by 1917, both the Miners Rest and Coghills Creek Churches were greatly weakened with reduced attendances. The Miners Rest Church was therefore attached to the Burrumbeet-Windermere Charge.

The exodus of Miners Rest residents continued after the First World War. Consequently, the Miners Rest Church became part of the Creswick Charge that included the Presbyterian Churches at Creswick and Scrub Hill.

Throughout the 20th century, congregational attendances at the Miners Rest Presbyterian Church were modest. In 1959, it was hoped that with Miners Rest being very close to Ballarat, 'a big house-building project . will eventually bring more and more people into the life of the Church.'

In 1965, the church at Miners Rest adopted the name of St. James' Presbyterian Church. A further change in name and status came in 1979, when with the Union of Methodist, Congregational and some Presbyterian Churches, the Uniting Church of Australia was formed. At Miners Rest, the Church was known as St. James' Uniting Church.

HERITAGE CITATION REPORT

The Clergy

The Rev George Mackie (1823-1871) was licensed as a minister by the Free Church Presbytery of Brechin, Scotland in 1848. He was sent by its Colonial Committee to Australia, arriving in 1849. His first years were spent in N.S.W., serving the large area of Illawarra and Shoalhaven. In 1857, he went to Lake Learmonth and Burrumbeet in Victoria. It was from here where Mackie established Presbyterian Churches at Miners Rest, Creswick and Clunes, and he helped to create the Presbytery of Ballarat. It was Mackie who was therefore responsible for the establishment of St. James' Church and he conducted the first sermon in September 1859.

Immediately after the opening of the Miners Rest Church, the Rev Seaborn was the first supply minister for Miners Rest, Mt Blowhard and Coghills Creek. He served in this role for one month until the arrival of the Rev. W. Smyth, a probationer from Ireland who conducted his first service at Miners Rest on 19 October 1859. Smyth was subsequently ordained and inducted as the first minister of the Miners Rest, Mt Blowhard and Coghills Creek Churches.

Throughout the 19th and 20th centuries, the Miners Rest Church was served by 26 ministers. In addition to the Rev Smyth, the other ministers were: J. Don (1872-1874), J. Armour (1875-1877), F. Souter (1878-1888), J. Linklater (1888-1889), S. Walker (1899-1908), A. Stewart (1908-1912), J. McIntyre (1912-1916), F. Yeaman (1916-1917), R. Jones (1917-1926), J. Forsyth (1928-1935), T. Gibson (1935-1938), P. Turner (1938-1946), S. Hill (1946-1951), C. Harland (1951-1955), R. Shanks (1955-1961), J. Roberts (1961-1962), S. Paddle (1962-1966), R. Matters (1967-1974), A. North (1975-1979), A. Solomon (1980-1983), M. Willicombe (1984-1993), B. Hewson (1994-1997), Rev. Boatmand (1997-1998), G. Wells (1999-2004) and J. Robinson (2005-2009).

Notable People & Organisations of the Church

Throughout the life of the Presbyterian (and later Uniting) Church at Miners Rest, it has also been served by many outstanding lay men and women. From 1892, members of the Board of Management included: Dalgleish, W.R. Craig, James, Moore, William Ross, MacDonald, Fisher, Williamson, MacBeth, W. Brady, Innersley, William Galloway, Gray, G. Swan, Loader, Allan, Monteith, Surman, W. Hucker, Souter, Roxburgh, F. Parker, Paterson, Allan, Kennedy, W. Gilmore, D. Davidson, Henderson, C. Davis, Townrow, Vanstan, Campbell, Harrison, Duncan, A. McColl, Stevenson, Walker, W. Cox.

W. Hucker and his wife were connected with the Church for 30 years from 1897 until 1927. For twenty years, Mr Hucker was treasurer. Alex Bartley was actively connected with the Church from 1900 and in 1912 he was elected secretary of the Board of Management, a position he held until his death in 1943. S.R. Thomas was also a long-serving member of the Church. He was elected to the Board of Management in 1924, became treasurer in 1927, a position he continued until his death in 1946.

An important female figure in the life of the Church during the 20th century was Mrs Winnie Birch. She gave 90 years of service to the Miners Rest Church, becoming Superintendent of the Sunday School in 1953 and in 1983 she was the first female Elder of the Church. To celebrate Mrs Birch's service to the Church, two stained glass windows were installed behind the pulpit in 1992 on her 90th birthday. The windows were designed by Rosemary Anderson and made by Belinda Bawden of Country Road Leadlight. They were dedicated by the Rev. Willcombe. Upon the death of Mrs Birch in 1996, she was remembered as an 'inspiration' that 'was there every Sunday to welcome us all'. Members of the congregation planted a Camellia Tree in the Church grounds in memory of her and Ed Callow 'put a strong tree guard around it to prevent cows and vandals'. Both the windows and the tree associated with Mrs Birch do not appear to be part of the surviving fabric today.

In addition to the importance of the Board of Management Committee and its members in the 19th and 20th centuries was the contribution made by branch of the Presbyterian Women's Mission Union (PWMU) from 1900 and the Ladies Guild from 1955. These female organisations were instrumental in raising funds for much-needed maintenance and repairs

HERITAGE CITATION REPORT

throughout the years.

Church Closure

In 2009, as a result of a dwindled congregation and much-needed repairs to comply with regulations, the St. James' Uniting Church closed. The closing service was held on 31 May 2009, with the Rev. Joy Robinson officiating. Although there were only 5-6 regular members by this time, 'people came from all over Australia to the little church for the celebration, which was followed by lunch and exchanging of fond memories.' One of the last members was Mrs Margaret Catherall who had been worshipping at St. James' Church for 50 years and who 'was sad to see the church close.' A former member who had returned for the farewell service was Marg Fisher from Warrnambool, who had been baptized at the church in 1939, was a Sunday School teacher and who married 'her sweetheart' there in 1962.

The closure of the church in 2009 brought to an end 150 years of Presbyterian (and later Uniting) Church life to the small settlement of Miners Rest.

2.4 The Architect: Joseph Atwood Doane

Joseph Atwood Doane (1822-1901) was born on 5 October 1822 at Barrington, Nova Scotia (Canada), the seventh child of Josiah Payne Doane (1784-1875), carpenter and farmer, and Mary (nee Wood).

During his formative years, it would appear that J.A. Doane was exposed to the traditions, religion, education and pursuits of the well-known Doane family at Barrington Head. This small coastal village was the headquarters of the region's fishing businesses as well as the location of shipbuilding and lumbering, and to a lesser degree, farming. Doane was probably educated at the local school house where, in 1799, his great grandfather, Samuel Osborne Doane, was the first School Master.

While J.A. Doane's father was a carpenter, his grandfather, Samuel O. Doane Jnr., held a prominent position in the Barrington Head township. He was the Proprietor's Clerk and Registrar, and the only Commissioner authorized to solemnize marriages. With carpentry and shipbuilding important industries in the town, it is not surprising that J.A. Doane gained experience in the building industry. It is unlikely that he received a formal architectural education abroad (unlike his brother, Arnold, who studied music in London and obtained a diploma), as this was not uncommon for the time. In design terms, master masons and carpenters were often educated through access to architectural treatises, combining the design theory with their practical carpentry, shipbuilding and cabinet-making skills. Edwin Crowell in *A History of Barrington Township and Vicinity* alludes to this in local house building as follows:

. during the first half of the nineteenth century the primitive dwellings mostly disappeared and gave place to houses having ornate porticos and exterior finishes, interior conveniences and elegance of furnishing. A great variety of styles came in . The local carpenters added the dormer window and Greek porch when the funds were available. The last half-century has seen the introduction of many showy and expensive houses on American patterns.

J.A. Doane was therefore probably exposed to the carpentry skills of his father, the shipbuilding business of his older brother Warren, and local developments in the town.

On 21 July 1851, J.A. Doane married Catherine Winthrop Sargent (1821-1855). This was just one year before they set sail on Warren Doane's schooner, *Sebim*, for the Ballarat goldfields on 12 July 1852. Doane left with his brothers, Seth and Arthur (and their wives and children), and Arnold (historian and trained musician), and friends Jacob Crowell, Daniel and William Sargent, Peter Coffin Jnr., Donald MacDonald and David and John Gabriel. To help fund the voyage, additional passages were advertised at £25 each. The departure of the *Sebim* was reported in the *Montreal Gazette* ten days later:

HERITAGE CITATION REPORT

Another band of emigrants left our shores, on board the brig *Sebim*, last Tuesday, for Australia. The number of passengers by the *Sebim*, was 42, comprising 31 men, 6 women and 5 children. They belonged in different proportions to Halifax, Barrington, Liverpool, Amherst, Shubenacadie, Chester, Windsor, Cumberland, Stewiacke and Dartmouth. Advertisement of vessels about sailing from New York and Boston for Australia are in circulation through the Province, offering fresh opportunities to those who may be discontented with the heritage that is given them in this country to quit, and take up their abode in a distant land. We fear some will have reason to repent, most sorely, before long, of their rashness in leaving home. Notwithstanding all the obstacles to getting rich that we have to contend with in this country, there are many examples abounding of people rapidly rising from poverty to affluence and independence, not only in this city, but in other parts of the Province .

Upon arrival in Ballarat, Doane was first engaged in gold mining. After the death of his wife, Catherine, in 1855, his full interest in gold mining activities appears to have waned, probably from a lack of major finds. In February 1857, he advertised for sale a half sleeping share in the Great Eastern Mining Company, although he continued to retain mining interests until at least 1869.

He then turned to his former profession of building construction superintendence, architectural design and cabinet-making, first advertising his business in *The Star* newspaper on 22 October 1857:

J.A. DOANE,

ARMSTRONG - STREET,

WOULD respectfully inform his friends and the public, that he is prepared to superintend the erection of buildings, and to furnish architectural designs, &c., according to instructions. J.A.D. trusts from his experience in this and other colonies, to be able to give satisfaction to all those who may favor him with their orders.

N.B. - Counting room and parlor furniture made to order.

Doane's first commission came a few months later in February 1858, when he called tenders for the erection of a brick cottage. This was followed by a small timber Free Presbyterian Church in Sturt Street in March 1858. A more substantial commission at this time was his engagement by St. Paul's Church of England, Ballarat East, to prepare drawings and superintend the construction of a new church, as outlined in *The Star*:

We understand that the plans were drawn by Mr J.A. Doane, from sketches furnished by the clergyman, the Rev. C. Searle, and the former gentleman has superintended the erection.

Other substantial commissions followed, including the design for the Ballarat Benevolent Asylum (1860), supervision of the first stage of the Ballarat Mechanics' Institute (1860) and the design of the old Buninyong Shire Hall (1869). He was also responsible for the designs of the former Lister and Angel Warehouse in Lydiard Street North and Pratt's Warehouse, corner of Camp and Mair Streets (1868), and the dwelling known as 'Lauderdale', built for Ballarat's first millionaire, John Winter, in 1862.

Doane was an active member of the Wesleyan Methodist Church in Ballarat, following on from his family's involvement in the Methodist Church in Barrington. Between 1853 and 1875, he was the Superintendent of the Lydiard Street Methodist Church, a Trustee of the Church, member of the building committee of the Lydiard Street Church, and a Sunday School teacher. It was from this latter position where he met Jessie Lockie and they married in 1857.

Given Doane's active involvement in the Methodist Church, it is not surprising that he became a prolific designer of non-conformist churches in the Ballarat area in the 1850s and 1860s. During this period, he was responsible for the designs of at least 16 churches. Most of these commissions were for the Wesleyan Methodist denomination. In addition to the Free

HERITAGE CITATION REPORT

Presbyterian Church in Sturt Street and St. Paul's Church of England, Ballarat, he designed St. James' Presbyterian Church, Miners Rest, in 1859. His Wesleyan Methodist designs included those in the Ballarat area: Barkly Street (1860), Wendouree (1860), Clunes (1863), Neil Street (1862 & 1867), Scotchmans Lead (Buninyong) (1864), Mt Pleasant (1865), Rubicon Street (1867), Pleasant Street (1867), Golden Point (1867), Eyre Street (1868), Sebastopol (1869), Brown Hill (1869), and Little Bendigo (Nerrina) (1869). Possibly the grandest design based on Classical stylistic derivatives, was the Dawson Street Baptist Church (1862).

Doane also held important civic and community roles in Ballarat. In 1865, he was Mayor of Ballarat West and he served three terms as President of the Ballarat Visiting and Benevolent Association. He unsuccessfully stood for Parliament in 1869. Other interests included his membership of the Ballarat Philharmonic Society. Music had been an important part of Doane family life, with Doane's father, Josiah, a member of the church choir, and his brother, Arnold, a trained musician.

In May 1875, Doane and his wife, Jessie, left their residence at 14 Seymour Crescent (which he had designed in 1862) and departed on the *Great Britain* for Liverpool in the United Kingdom. It is not known whether he returned to Nova Scotia to visit his father (who died in July of that year). By 1878, Doane had relocated to Leith, Scotland, the birthplace of his wife, where he established an architectural practice.

Joseph and Jessie Doane returned to Australia in November 1887. They resided in Melbourne where Doane's architectural practice was re-established. There, he designed a number of dwellings and churches, including the Baptist Church in Hawthorn (1890). Doane died on 14 November 1901 at his residence in Surrey Hills.

Description

Physical Description

3.1 Setting

The former St. James' Presbyterian Church, 10 Creswick Street, Miners Rest, is set on a rectangular allotment having a modest setback from the front boundary. This boundary is defined by a concrete post and cyclone wire fence to a height of approximately 1300 mm. There are also wire pedestrian and vehicular gates. The church building has noticeable side setbacks. The north of the site is defined by a single storey former Air Force Hut which has functioned as a church hall. At the rear of the church is a late 20th century flat-roofed toilet block constructed of concrete blocks. In recent times the setting of the church has been diminished by the removal of mature trees, leaving the church building surrounded by open grassed areas.

Immediately adjoining the church to the south is the former Miners Rest Fire Brigade Building. It has a stepped face brick parapet at the front, with a gabled roof behind. There is an introduced colorbond skillion extension on its north side. The front of the fire brigade site is also characterised by a concrete post and cyclone wire fence and wire vehicular gates of identical design as the front church fence and gates.

3.2 Church Building

Exterior

The elevated single storey, Victorian Early English Gothic styled former St. James' Presbyterian (Uniting) Church building is characterised by a steeply-pitched gable roof form having corbelled parapets at the north and south ends. The building is constructed of galvanized corrugated steel roof cladding and original rendered brick wall construction on a

HERITAGE CITATION REPORT

bluestone plinth. Parts of the walls may have been re-rendered and the bluestone has introduced overpainting.

A feature of the design is the main (west) gable end which is identified by tripartite, lancet windows with point-arched and rendered label moulds above. The timber framed diamond leadlight glazing behind the introduced clear glazing in the lancets are original although the early timber tracery in the windows has been covered over. Below the lancet windows are a Tudor-inspired label mould and a projecting minor gabled front porch. This porch represents an early addition as it interrupts the original central arched label mould of the original main door opening behind. The early porch has a narrow pointed-arched lancet in the gable end and side door openings. The southern opening has an early vertically boarded door, although the six paneled door on the north side appears to have been introduced.

The side (longitudinal) elevations of the building are defined by four bays of pointed arched windows separated by rendered buttresses. Each window has original timber framing with introduced frosted yellow glazing (possibly replacing earlier diamond leadlights). The protective wire exterior mesh has also been introduced.

At the rear of the building are two original pointed-arched window openings (now blocked up) and a minor gabled vestry wing. This wing has been introduced at an early time (it interrupts the original windows) and it is clad in introduced polycarbonate weatherboards. The roof is clad in galvanized corrugated steel. There is an introduced aluminium framed sliding window on the north side and on the south elevation is an early door opening with a vertically boarded timber door.

3.3 Interior

From photographic evidence provided by Council, internally, the church is characterised by a preaching hall having a coved timber lined ceiling with exposed timber trusses and metal ties, hard plastered walls and introduced timber dados, unfinished Baltic pine floor boards, early paneled timber door at the east (rear) end and a raised (and carpeted) platform at the east end. It is understood that the timber pews and other fittings have been removed.

3.4 Condition

The exterior of the former St. James' Church is in fair condition. Fieldwork identified the following immediately noticeable conservation issues:

- . Drummy render to walls (especially noticeable on the front wall).
- . Missing glazing to porch window.
- . Rusted galvanized corrugated steel roof cladding, gutters and downpipes.
- . Diagonal wall cracks (above front buttress and above window at rear).
- . Weathered timber window framing and timber doors.
- . Lichen growth on buttress cappings.

3.5 Integrity

The former St. James' Church is predominantly intact. It retains its original form, design details and wall construction, while the roof cladding is a replacement of earlier corrugated sheet metal (the original roof cladding may have been slate - an inspection in the roof space might confirm the earliest roof construction). Although the front porch, rear vestry and rendered wall finish are not original, they represent early and important additions. The most notable external change is

the introduced frosted yellow glazing in the side and porch windows and the introduced cladding to the rear vestry.

Comparative Analysis

Refer to attachment for an illustrated and referenced version of this comparative analysis.

4.1 Introduction

The comparative analysis establishes an architectural, historical and social context for the former St. James' Presbyterian Church, Miners Rest (refer to attachment for referenced version). In particular, the church building may be compared with:

- . Other surviving mid 19th century churches design by the architect, J.A. Doane.
- . Other surviving 19th century public buildings in Miners Rest.

4.2 Other Surviving Mid 19th Century Churches by J.A. Doane

4.2.1 Background to the Gothic Revival

The Victorian Early English Gothic design of the former St. James' Presbyterian Church reflects an early exemplar of non-conformist Gothic architecture in the Ballarat region. In the 1840s and early 1850s, the striking differences in Christian denominations (particularly the differences between Catholic and Anglican, and the non-conformist Presbyterian, Wesleyan, Congregational, Bible Christian and Baptist churches) were revealed in architectural compositions and styles. The architect of the former St. James' Church, J.A. Doane, was exposed to non-conformist church design philosophy through his involvement with the Wesleyan Church in Ballarat from the 1850s.

A.W.N. Pugin and the Gothic Revival

From 1837 in England, there was a resurgence in Gothic Revival design for both Catholic and Anglican churches. The progenitor of the Gothic architectural movement in England at this time was the highly influential architect and writer, A.W.N. Pugin. A convert to Roman Catholicism during the revival of the Catholic Church in England in the early 19th century, Pugin published a number of widely read and utilized publications, including *Contrasts, or a Parallel between the architecture of the Fourteenth and Fifteenth Centuries and Similar Buildings of the Present Day* (1836) and *True Principles of Pointed or Christian Architecture* (1841).

Underlying Pugin's architectural philosophy was a strong religious argument. 'Gothic was deemed to be the ecclesiastical style for the true Catholic Church: it is chiefly verticality, Pugin argued, that expresses the Christian concern with upwardness. A Classical church symbolized worldliness.' Pugin also went further with his claims, as Dixon and Muthesius in *Victorian Architecture* state:

As to the more detailed and more literal elements of Christian symbolism, such as the instruments of the liturgy, Pugin was convinced that anything Classical must be pagan and thus utterly unsuitable for Christian churches and a Christian society.

19th Century Non-Conformist Architecture

HERITAGE CITATION REPORT

The repeal of the Corporation and Test Act in 1828 gave the vote to many Nonconformist citizens which removed some of the influential social barriers previously in place that had given greater control to the Established Church (Church of England) in England. The major non-conformist denominations included the Congregationalists, Unitarians, Wesleyans, Methodists, Primitive Methodists and the Presbyterians. However, in Scotland, the non-conformists such as the Church of Scotland were the "Establishment".

In general terms, non-conformist architecture was basically represented by a large hall (known especially as either a preaching box or meeting house) with a simple front porch. The basic functional requirements for the different non-conformist denominations were the same, as Dixon and Muthesius assert:

First of all, a large congregation had to be housed as cheaply as possible - usually much more cheaply than the Established Church. Then, because the sermon was the most important part of the service, the chief requirements inside were that everyone should hear and see the preacher. The accommodation problem was solved by the use of galleries on three sides, generally supported by iron pillars. The fourth side was usually given over to the pulpit or to a more elaborate affair on several levels with stairs, the "rostrum", and often held the organ as well . In addition there are entrances and exits, stairs to the gallery, and a porch or foyer. The main entrance is a major feature, almost invariably placed in the facade and not at the side . For most chapels, the facade is the only part of the exterior given any "architectural" treatment . The elevation is usually two-storeyed, denoting the gallery inside, with windows of Georgian proportions, often round-arched . As in ordinary Victorian houses, these features must be seen as survivals of Classical architecture . Country chapels tend to be simpler versions of the more spectacular urban chapels .

This type of design was viewed disparagingly by the Established Church, claiming that they 'were hardly religious edifices at all but merely lecture halls.'

Local Stylistic Background

Stylistically, church building in Ballarat in the 1850s and 1860s reflected British precedents. The Roman Catholics - through the design of St. Patrick's Cathedral in 1857-63 - took up the Gothic Revival idiom of A.W.N. Pugin. Likewise, did the Church of England, initially with the building of St. Paul's Anglican Church, Bakery Hill in 1858. It was in also 1857 when the first of the non-conformists, the Wesleyan Methodists, turned completely to Gothic design for their churches while retaining the preaching hall prototype. At the opening of the Methodist Chapel in Lydiard Street, Ballarat in 1858, the well-known teacher, author, historian and non-conformist, James Bonwick, encapsulated contemporary Wesleyan philosophy in the designs of churches:

He approved of making places of worship as comfortable as possible, and alluded in well chosen terms to the pile of Wesleyan chapel buildings in Melbourne. He preferred the Gothic architecture as more spiritual than the ponderous Egyptian architecture, and the more refined ornaments of a Grecian temple.

These latter architectural styles continued to be used by other non-conformist denominations. The Baptists, for example, erected an elaborate Classical church at 3 Dawson Street in 1866-67, to a design by J.A. Doane. This had followed the construction of a more modest Classical synagogue design by T.B. Cameron for the Jewish community at the corner of Barkly Street and Princes Street South, in 1861.

However, most of the non-conformist denominations, including the Presbyterians and Congregationalists, soon adopted the Gothic style for church buildings. These Gothic designs were described in *The Star* in 1862 as 'the latest period of pointed architecture.'

4.2.2 Other Non-Conformist Churches by Doane

As outlined in Section 2.4, J.A. Doane's design and building supervision output for church buildings in the 1850s and

HERITAGE CITATION REPORT

1860s in the Ballarat region was prolific. Overall, he either designed and/or supervised four stylistic versions of churches. The stylistic types are briefly outlined with a selection of examples:

Type 1: Early English Gothic with polygonal tower and spire

St. Paul's Anglican Church, Bakery Hill

This church was built in 1858. It was designed by the Rev. C. Searle with the plans prepared by Doane. It was constructed with a steeply pitched gabled roof form having parapets with corbelled ends. There was a polygonal tower to one side surmounted by a spire having an open point-arched arcade. The main gable end features a rosette window with large tripartite window below. Above this tripartite window and the front door were Tudor label moulds. These moulds were to become a distinctive feature of some of Doane's designs. Stepped buttresses represented another design characteristic. The building collapsed down a mine shaft in 1864 and the existing church constructed and opened in 1865.

Other Examples

Other examples include the former Congregational School House/Chapel at the corner of Mair and Dawson Streets, erected in 1862, and the former Wesleyan Methodist Church, Clunes, built in 1863. Both these churches were designed by Doane and are similar to the original St. Paul's Church, Bakery Hill. They feature stepped gabled parapets, trefoil rosettes, large tracery windows, and polygonal towers surmounted by spires.

Type 2: Early English Gothic

The Early English Gothic type was similar to the St. Paul's, Congregational and Clunes churches, except that they did not feature a tower. The earliest example designed by Doane was St. James' Presbyterian Church, Miners Rest in 1859. The simple steeply-pitched gabled form with parapets having corbelled ends, tripartite lancet windows distinctive Tudor-label moulds above the lower windows and original door opening, and the stepped buttresses epitomized this stylistic type, as did the original porch-less design. The most comparable example to the Miners Rest Church is the former Methodist Church, Barkly Street, built in 1860. It survives today, being larger and slightly more elaborate. The characteristic stepped gabled parapet, tripartite lancets, central entrance opening, label moulds and buttresses are evident. Like the building at Miners Rest, the Barkly Street Church also has also lost its original diamond leadlight windows, having been replaced with stained glass.

Another surviving example of this type is the former Brown Hill Wesleyan Methodist Church, Humffray Street, designed by Doane in 1869. It has the characteristic stepped gable parapet and label moulds, although the tripartite lancets are larger, extending much lower. There are also two main entrance doors and the ends of the parapets surmounted by pinnacles.

Type 3: Rudimentary Early English Gothic

These churches were designed by Doane in a very similar manner as other Early English Gothic churches (including Miners Rest), but in a more rudimentary way. The former Wesleyan Church, Nerrina, designed by Doane in 1865, is a typical example. It has a steeply pitched gable roof with characteristic parapet featuring a rectangular apex and corbelled ends. However, the main gable end is identified by a large rose window below which are pointed-arched windows flanking the main door opening.

Type 4: Classical Revival

Doane's most substantial and elaborate church design was the former Baptist Church, Dawson Street, built in 1866-67 in

HERITAGE CITATION REPORT

a Classical Revival style. The building survives today and it is characterised by a monumental Classical portico.

4.3 Other Surviving 19th Century Public Buildings in Miners Rest

Only three other 19th century public buildings survive in Miners Rest today. These are:

. Miners Rest Hotel, 216 Howe Street: this is the location of an early hotel, possibly the Derby Hotel, from c.1859.

. Miners Rest Primary School, 26-32 Dundas Street: this brick, Victorian Department of Education 80-Type school building was constructed in 1876. The first Head Teacher was William Bradey. A detached timber teacher's cottage was built in 1887. The school building survives and appears to be predominantly intact.

. Miners Rest Community Hall, 8 Market Street: this timber, barrel-vaulted building was originally constructed as the Mechanics Institute in 1888 to a design by William Brazenor, Ballarat architect. It appears to be predominantly intact and in good condition.

4.4 Conclusions

From the comparative analysis, historical research and physical evidence, it is found that the former St. James' Presbyterian Church, Miners Rest, is:

. The earliest-known surviving church design by J.A. Doane, a prolific church architect in Ballarat in the 1850s and 1860s.

. A predominantly intact example of the Victorian Early English Gothic style in the Ballarat region. The original design characteristics are clearly evident in the: steeply-pitched and gabled roof form with parapet having corbelled ends; buttresses; bays of pointed-arched window openings; and the specific design traits by Doane including the tripartite lancet windows with diamond leading, rendered wall finish and the Tudor label moulds.

. A modest example of the work of Doane (given its rural location). The most comparable surviving church is the former Wesleyan Methodist Church in Barkly Street, Ballarat, built in 1860 (a year after the Miners Rest building). The Barkly Street church is larger and slightly more elaborate, as identified in the stepped parapet in the gable end. The Tudor label mould above the central entrance door is almost identical to the original design of the Miners Rest church, prior to the construction of the front porch.

. One of only four 19th century public buildings (and the only church) surviving in Miners Rest.

Statement of Significance

What is Significant

The former St. James' Presbyterian (Uniting) Church, 10 Creswick Street, has significance as a predominantly intact example of the Victorian Early English Gothic style, the only surviving church building in Miners Rest and as the earliest-known example of the work of the prolific mid 19th century Ballarat architect, J.A. Doane. The church also has significance as a physical legacy of the life and development of the Presbyterian denomination at Miners Rest for 150 years. Established in late 1858 by the Rev. George Mackie, Presbyterian Minister of Lake Learmonth and Burrumbete, the church building was constructed in 1859 and it opened in September of that year. The front porch, rear vestry and rendered wall finish represent early and important additions.

HERITAGE CITATION REPORT

How is it Significant

The former St. James' Presbyterian (Uniting) Church, 10 Creswick Street, Miners Rest, is architecturally, historically and socially significant at a LOCAL level.

Why is it Significant

The former St. James' Presbyterian (Uniting) Church is architecturally significant at a LOCAL level (AHC D.2, E.1). The building forms a local heritage landmark at Miners Rest, being one of the very few surviving 19th century buildings in the locality and the only surviving church at Miners Rest. It demonstrates original design qualities of the Victorian Early English Gothic style. These qualities include the steeply-pitched gable roof form having corbelled parapets, brick wall construction on a bluestone plinth, tripartite lancet windows in the main gable end (with pointed-arched and rendered label moulds), surviving arched central entrance label mould flanking the front porch, Tudor-inspired label mould below the lancet windows, diamond leadlighting in the lancet windows, four bayed composition of the longitudinal elevations defined by projecting rendered buttresses and pointed-arched windows (apart from the introduced yellow frosted glazing). The front entrance porch, rear vestry and rendered wall finish represent significant early (19th century) alterations and additions (apart from the introduced wall cladding to the vestry). The corrugated sheet metal roof cladding is not original, but it also represents an early significant change to the building.

The former St. James' Presbyterian (Uniting) Church is historically significant at a LOCAL level (AHC A.4, H.1). It is associated with the life and development of the Presbyterian (and later Uniting) Church denomination at Miners Rest for 150 years from 1859 until 2009. In particular, the church has associations with a number of clergy and congregational members who were influential in its long-serving function. These people included the Rev. George Mackie, founder of the local Presbyterian Church, Rev. W. Smyth, first incumbent Presbyterian Minister, W. Hucker (early treasurer), Alex Barley (secretary 1912-1943), and S.R. Thomas (treasurer 1927-1946). An important female figure throughout the 20th century was Mrs Winnie Birch. She gave 90 years of service, becoming Superintendent of the Sunday School in 1953 and in 1983 she was the first female Elder of the Church. St. James' Presbyterian Church also has associations with Joseph Atwood Doane, Ballarat architect. He was a prolific Church architect in Ballarat and district in the 1850s and 1860s, and the Miners Rest church is his earliest-known surviving design.

The former St. James' Presbyterian (Uniting) Church is socially significant at a LOCAL level (AHC G.1). Although the building no longer functions for religious purposes, it continues to be recognized by former members of the congregation as a physical legacy of their faith and faith education that endured from 1859 until its closure in 2009. This social value is therefore embodied in the existing physical fabric.

Recommendations 2012

External Paint Controls

Yes

Internal Alteration Controls

No

Tree Controls

No

Fences & Outbuildings

No

Prohibited Uses May Be Permitted

Yes

Incorporated Plan

N/A

Aboriginal Heritage Place

No

This information is provided for guidance only and does not supersede official documents, particularly the planning scheme. Planning controls should be verified by checking the relevant municipal planning scheme.